



TO: Banu Özkazanç, U. of Massachusetts, Boston
Co-Chair, Critical Management Studies (CMS) Division
Paul Donnelly, Dublin Institute of Technology
Co-Chair, CMS Division

FROM: Alison M. Konrad, Western U.
Chair, Division and Interest Group Relations (DIGR) Committee
BOG Representative at Large

CC: DIGR Committee Members:

Jackie Coyle-Shapiro, London School of Economics (BOG Vice-President and Program Chair)
Alain Fayolle, E. M. Lyon (Past Division Chair, ENT)
Elizabeth George, U. of Auckland (BOG Representative at Large)
Dev Jennings, U. of Alberta (Past Division Chair, ONE)
Carol Kulik, U. of South Australia (BOG President-elect & Coordinator of Professional Divisions)
Carrie Leana, U. of Pittsburgh (BOG Representative at Large)
Vicky Parker, U. of New Hampshire (Past Division Chair, HCM)

DATE: May 24, 2018

RE: Feedback on CMS Division's 5 Year Report

Thank you for your detailed and thorough 5-year review report. In particular, the DIGR Committee appreciated your clear set of opening issues and return to them at the end of the report, your thorough analysis comparing the 2013 review and progress over the past five years, your nicely interwoven use of data, analysis and preliminary insight in the writing of the report, and your willingness to be honestly self-critical as a Division. As you continue to develop your strategic vision for CMS's future, we encourage you to keep AOM's "moonshot" goals for 2022 in mind; the moonshots are listed at the end of this report. **On April 28, 2018, the AOM Board of Governors voted to renew the CMS Division for the next five years.**

Feedback on 5-year Review Report

In reviewing each of the AOM Division and Interest Group reports, the DIGR committee members were asked to identify what they see as strengths, challenges or concerns in going forward as well as efforts underway that lessen these concerns. Taking these into consideration, we offer recommendations for the Division going forward. Here, I detail these comments in the hope that our feedback will enable you to build on the strengths of the CMS Division and advance our shared goal of strengthening and invigorating the Academy of Management.

Strengths

The 5-year review shows some strong aspects of the CMS Division. There was a 30% response rate to the member survey, which is above the 27% average for Divisions and Interest Groups completing reviews this cycle. CMS Division members also show consistently higher rates of voting in Division elections compared to the average for AOM. These numbers suggest an engaged membership. Sixty-nine percent of respondents consider CMS their primary division/interest group, which indicates the importance of CMS as an AOM “home” for many of its members, roughly 70% of whom are located outside of the U.S. Given the AOM’s aspiration to be the premier academic professional association in the field of management and its ongoing challenge in building a truly global membership base, the success of the CMS Division in attracting non-U.S. is one of the many ways the Division adds value to the AOM as a whole.

The CMS Division has stabilized its membership at about 750, despite being negatively affected by the U.S. Presidential Executive Orders banning travel from a number of Muslim-majority countries in 2017. The Division shows a strong capacity to attract new members, which increased from 101 in 2013 to 131 in 2017 and is higher than the average for AOM overall.

Respondents to the member survey also generally report high levels of member satisfaction. In particular, survey results reflected a high level of satisfaction with the sense of community, welcoming nature of the Division for members of various demographic groups, and efforts to reach out to non-U.S. members. These results support the effectiveness of the Division in providing an AOM home for an international group of scholars, many of whom view the Division as their primary link to AOM.

Through its intellectual content as well as through providing a sense of community for an international group of scholars, the role that CMS plays within AOM is not duplicated by any other Division. The CMS is a small yet very passionate division and is doing an excellent job in meeting its members’ needs and promoting its role in debate/discussion of management. In particular, the CMS Division was a key voice in motivating the AOM’s response to the U.S. Presidential Executive Order. CMS leaders provided essential advice and help in developing the AOM policy changes needed to enable AOM leadership to take a stand when public policy actions threaten the existence, purpose, or functioning of the AOM as an organization as well as a process through which AOM members can call on the AOM leadership to make a statement.

Challenges/Concerns

Several challenges and/or concerns were noted by members of the DIGR Committee, and many of these were also noted in the CMS Division report. They are:

- Need for a greater understanding of the decline in US membership as well as high rates of member turnover
- Determining how to meet the needs of members who typically do not attend the annual AOM meeting
- Declining student membership over the last 5 years



- Little progress in building engagement with other AOM Divisions. In this regard, there is a need to develop a mutual sense of the relevance of interaction between Divisions.
- Variability in attendance at the annual meeting and reduced submissions with higher acceptance rates (although 2017 was an anomaly)
- High percentage of non-U.S. members and cost associated with attending the annual meeting couple with competition from the bi-annual CMS conference
- Building a sense of community outside the annual meeting and the potential value of Connect@AOM, along with a concern that community-building initiatives are overly reliant on technology/overly optimistic regarding the capacity of technology to address critical needs such as mentoring, retaining members, etc.
- There is a very low score for volunteering in some capacity (1.44) although this is not idiosyncratic to the CMS division
- Mentoring has been identified in the report as an area to be addressed
- Financial situation and the difficulty of meeting costs
- A general lack of clarity regarding strategic plans with specific action items that will address challenges and achieve aspirations

Somewhat lessening these concerns, the report demonstrates a lot of consideration of ways to ensure that the future of the division is vibrant and healthy such an expansion of services to members (external relations and communities of practice). The report also provides potential avenues for AOM Connect to help meet the needs of members. The report outlines action points for trying to improve security of the division's finances.

The CMS Division is clearly monitoring its progress of initiatives/goals arising from the 2013 5-year review and uses this as a basis for developing aspirations for 2018-22. The aspirational goals are strategic in nature and reflect a commitment to use the 5 year review as a strategic opportunity.

Also somewhat lessening these concerns are the following:

- Plans to use Connect@AOM to deliver benefit to members who do not attend annual meeting
- Plans to explore possible small conference opportunity
- Working to get insight into reasons for membership non-renewals
- Plan to work with other divisions and use PDWs, website, etc. to raise awareness of CMS area
- Increase in CMS' voice in the AOM, in particular, the advice and help with AOM's response to the troublesome U.S. Executive Orders
- Strategic aspirational statements, however, the aspirations are not turned into objectives, strategies, and action plans. We would also like to see all Divisions align their strategic aspirations with the AOM moonshots for 2022.

Recommendations

We suggest some recommendations for moving forward (several of these derive from ideas included in CMS's write up):

- A main recommendation is to turn aspirations into objectives, to determine priorities and then to define the strategies and action plans to achieve the objectives. CMS's plan to articulate pathways and review roles is a beginning



- Continue to serve as an important voice within AOM regarding national policies that limit engagement of our global membership and helping AOM to develop a global outlook.
- Develop links to other Divisions to highlight CMS scholarship to a broader set of AOM members. A representative-at-large or a task force aimed at targeted outreach to other Divisions could be quite valuable for this purpose; these ideas were part of the CMS Division's plans in 2013; it is unclear why they were not implemented. Identify ways to address the troublesome issue of mutuality in the need to demonstrate relevance, including actions that AOM could take to facilitate these linkages.
- Develop and implement specific action plans for exploring whether Connect@AOM can be a vehicle to set up virtual mentoring circles or groups; at the same time, don't rely exclusively on technology to address mentoring/connections. Take advantage of the Division's small size and develop methods to better (and more deeply) connect across international boundaries and academic rank.
- The report mentions the specialized conference initiative only briefly. CMS could engage with this initiative and host a conference in a UK "hotbed" but make deliberate outreach attempts to bring North/South American scholars there.
- Develop and implement a specific plan for sponsorship – target specific potential sources and amounts, and link to budget for divisional activities



MOONSHOTS

By 2022, the AOM will be *the* premier global community for management and organization scholars and for advancing the impact of management and organization science on business and society worldwide.

Specifically for members...

- AOM will connect members of the global management and organization community with one another and with external audiences through an unparalleled portfolio of engagement opportunities that transcend technological and geographic boundaries.
- AOM will provide to a diverse membership indispensable value characterized by extensive professional services, vibrant volunteerism, interactive communities, and re-imagined governance.

Specifically for the field of management and organization science...

- AOM will fundamentally advance knowledge creation and content dissemination for greater relevancy and impact on a diverse set of stakeholders and institutions around the world.
- AOM will aggressively and effectively champion the external standing of organization and management scientists as a globally-led, inclusively governed association.

